



Comments on the Article Named "A Journey in Time: Muslim, Arab, and Persian Physicians and the History of Surgery"

Dear Editor,

I read with interest the article A Journey in Time; Muslim, Arab, and Persian Physicians and the History of Surgery by Taqi and AlNasrallah published in volume 14(1) of your journal. (Taqi, and AlNasrallah, 2025, pp. 19-32)

The article has ambitious definitions: A Journey in Time, Muslim, History of Surgery. I would like to admit that I was very excited about discovering lesser-known historical figures. Since they point to a large whole, these titles evoke comprehensive reviews: 'Muslim' and 'History of Surgery'. The abstract's closing further emphasizes the broad focus of the study: "By highlighting these contributions, we seek to rectify the historical oversight and endure the profound impact of these scholars and their contributions to medicine and surgery".

The word Muslim has a wide geographical connotation, namely, the geography of Islamic civilization. Moreover, in such a vast geography, scientists from many different religions, nationalities, and ethnicities produced knowledge

Hidir Kadircan Keskinbora (M.D., Ph.D.)10

1- Professor, Department of History of Medicine and Ethics, Faculty of Medicine, Bahcesehir University, Istanbul, Turkive

Correspondence:

Hidir Kadircan Keskinbora

Professor, Department of History of Medicine and Ethics, Faculty of Medicine, Bahcesehir University, Istanbul,

e-mail: kadircan.keskinbora@gmail.com

Keskinbora, K.H., 2025. Comments or the article named "A Journey in Time Muslim, Arab, and Persian Physicians and the History of Surgery.". Res His. Med, 14(2), pp. 179-180. 10.30476 rhm.2025.50890.

and science that contributed to Islamic civilization and humanity. Despite this, even after reading the whole article, I could not understand the reason for the emphasis on Arab and Persian physicians in the title.

Is it possible not to mention Albucasis when it comes to surgery, Avicenna, and Rhazes in medicine? Journey in Time was completed by adding Haly Abbas and Ibn al-Quff to these three giant names.

The fuel of the time machine of the esteemed authors would not be enough for them to go as far as Mamluk, Anatolia, Azerbaijan, and Central Asia to examine the contributions of Turkish (Turkistan, Anatolian, Mamluk, Seljuk, Ottoman, etc.) physicians. Some of their most famous are Jalaleddin Hızır, Ishaq bin Murad from Gerede, Sherefeddin Sabuncuoglu, al-Rashid b. Ebu el-Vahsh b. Ebi Huaygah, Ebu al-Farac from Malatya, al-Sadîd al-Dimyatî, Haci Pasha, etc. (Keskinbora, Üvey, and Gökçe, 2006, pp. 82–86; Buharalı, 2006, pp. 29-39; Mazor, 2014, pp. 38-65; Üstün, 2017, pp. 36-44)

To better align the title and scope of the article, I believe that using the words 'Muslim' and 'journey in time' is inappropriate as it indicates a much larger scope than the authors' intentions.

Funding

None.

Conflict of Interest

None.

References

Buharalı, E., 2006. Üç Türk Hükümdarının Yaptırdığı Üç Sağlık Kurumu: Tolunoğulları, Zengiler ve Memlüklerde Sağlık Hizmetleri (Three Health Institutions Built by Three Turkish Rulers: Health Services in Tolunids, Zengids and Mamluks). *Tarih Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 25(40), pp. 29-39. [in Turkish]

Keskinbora, K.H., Üvey, D., and Gökçe, A.N., 2006. Cerrahiyet-Ül Haniyye'de göze inen suyun tedavisi ve katarakt cerrahisi tarihçesine kısa bir bakış [A brief overview of the treatment of water descending into the eye and the history of cataract surgery in Cerrahiyet-Ül Haniyye]. *Turk J Ophthalmol*, 36, pp. 82–86. [in Turkish]

Mazor, A., 2014. Jewish Court Physicians in the Mamluk Sultanate during the First Half of the 8th/14th Century. *Medieval Encounters*, 20, pp. 38-65. Brill.

Taqi, K.M., and AlNasrallah, N., 2025. A Journey in Time; Muslim, Arab, and Persian Physicians and the History of Surgery. *Res Hist Med*, 14(1), pp. 19-32. doi: 10.30476/rhm.2024.102348.1212.

Üstün, C., 2017. Aydınoğulları Zamanından İzmir ve Çevresinde Bir Âlim: Hacı Paşa (A Scholar from the Time of Aydınoğulları in İzmir and its Surroundings: Hacı Pasha). İzmir Araştırmaları Dergisi Prof. Dr. Serap Yılmaz Özel Sayısı, 3(7), pp. 36-44. [in Turkish]

Received: 25 Feb 2025; Accepted: 27 Feb 2025; Online published: 1 May 2025 Research on History of Medicine/ 2025 May; 14(2): 179-180.